

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
December, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: L. Brown, A. Davies, D. Dovey, A. Easson,
D. Evans, M. Feakins, R. Harris, G. Howard, P. Murphy, M. Powell,
A. Webb and S. Woodhouse

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Lowri Hughson-Smith	Senior Development Management Officer
Denzil – John Turbevill	Commercial Solicitor
Louise Corbett	Strategy & Policy Officer - Affordable Housing
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

County Councillor J. Higginson

1. Declarations of Interest

County Councillor L. Brown declared a personal interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/01804, as she is a local preacher on the Newport and Lower Wye circuit which covers Monmouth. She has not been involved in anything to do with this application.

County Councillor P. Murphy declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/01672, as the applicant is a personal friend. He left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee dated 5th November 2019 were confirmed and signed by the Chair subject to the following amendment:

Minute 1 – Declarations of Interest be amended as follows:

County Councillor A. Easson declared a personal interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2019/00997 as he is a governor of Ysgol Gymraeg Y Ffin.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
December, 2019 at 2.00 pm

3. Application DM/2019/00725 - Change of use and conversion of a traditional stone barn into a single residential dwelling (C3) along with associated curtilage and works. Llananant, Barn Brook Road, Penallt, Monmouthshire

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the 11 conditions as outlined in the report.

It was considered that approval of the application would be an improvement to the existing building and would bring it back into use. However, concern was expressed that the building had plastic rainwater goods that were not in keeping with the age of the building.

It was proposed by County Councillor R. Harris and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DM/2019/00725 be approved subject to the 11 conditions as outlined in the report and also subject to an additional condition being added to provide metal rainwater goods.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00725 be approved subject to the 11 conditions as outlined in the report and also subject to an additional condition being added to provide metal rainwater goods.

4. Application DM/2019/01333 - Relocation of children's playground at Chippenham Mead Village Green, Monmouth. Chippenham Mead Playground, Chippenhamgate Street, Monmouth

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Drybridge, Monmouth, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- There is a need to relocate the children's playground due to health and safety reasons and the proposed site is the most suitable location on the village green.
- There has been some reluctance from some people in the Monmouth area towards the relocation who consider that no changes should be made to the village green.
- However, we as an authority have an obligation and a duty to provide a suitable play area in the most suitable location on the village green and to make a significant improvement on the existing play area.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd December, 2019 at 2.00 pm

- The proposed relocation has the support of the majority of parents within the area. However, it was acknowledged that there are some concerns regarding noise levels and the potential for people to gather there in the evenings. The proposed relocation site is only metres away from the existing site and therefore, these arguments should not prevent approval of the application.
- The final details of the design will be addressed at the reserved matters stage. However, the design of the fencing and the play equipment will ensure the success of the proposal. Input from local groups would be helpful in delivering the best type of equipment which could be undertaken via consultation.
- An increase in the levels of biodiversity of the site within the village green should be considered with a view to providing appropriate planting to the original site. This would also provide much needed buffering of the nearby dual carriageway in respect of the village green.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- The proposed site is more open and safer than the original site. It is located on the other side of the bund reducing noise levels for residents.
- The proposed play area will consist of natural materials.
- Appropriate landscaping will benefit the area.
- The proposed play area will be located further away from the dual carriageway.
- Concern was expressed that the proposed new site will not be enclosed to prevent dog fouling of the area. However, it was noted that there might be difficulties involved in fully enclosing the play area located within the village green as this might affect the public access rights of the village green as well as potentially affecting obtaining village green consent for the play area. However, there are ways of reducing public access by providing appropriate planting as a means of addressing the concerns raised.
- It was suggested that a proposal be submitted outlining the specific issues that have been identified with a view to obtaining a fenced and gated area for the proposed play area which would improve the health and safety of the children who will be using the play area.
- A condition could be added that appropriate planting could be used as a suitable means of naturally enclosing the play area. When the village green application is submitted, representations can be made by appropriate organisations. This matter is dealt with by the Welsh Government Planning Inspectorate. Therefore, providing appropriate planting rather than a fence might be a better way forward.
- If the Committee was minded to approve the application, subject to the issues identified regarding dog fouling, a condition could be added that a scheme

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd December, 2019 at 2.00 pm

indicating the form of enclosure could be submitted to deal with the dog fouling issue to be agreed by the Local Planning Authority. Planning Officers would work with the Delegation Panel and the local Member to agree a list of consultees with a view to consulting on the type of equipment and the scheme to address the dog fouling issue.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DM/2019/01333 be approved subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report and that the following conditions be added:

- A means of enclosure of the play area to be agreed before works commence on site and carried out in accordance with the approved details before the approved play area is brought into use.
- A landscaping scheme for the existing play area to be submitted to and agreed by the Local Planning Authority to include its implementation.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	13
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01333 be approved subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report and that the following conditions be added:

- A means of enclosure of the play area to be agreed before works commence on site and carried out in accordance with the approved details before the approved play area is brought into use.
- A landscaping scheme for the existing play area to be submitted to and agreed by the Local Planning Authority to include its implementation.

5. Application DM/2019/01377 - Variation of condition 2 relating to application DC/2015/00938 (APP/E6840/A/16/3162841). Minor design amendment to include a Garden Studio and dwarf brick retaining walls with the dwelling curtilage in accordance with Condition 8 of Appeal Decision APP/E6840/A/16/3162841. Including regularisation of plan references in accordance with Non Material Amendment Application No: DM/2019/01118. Proposed Replacement Dwelling At Orchard House, Llanbadoc, Usk

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd December, 2019 at 2.00 pm

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- A condition to secure an obscured glazed window to the north elevation would be appropriate.
- The level of the plot will be returned to its original level alleviating concerns expressed by nearby residents.
- A request was made for consideration of the application to be deferred to look at any flooding issues that might arise if the levels of soil were to be raised. In response, it was noted that the land levels are currently under construction and not yet finished. However, the levels would need to be finished to the original topographical ground level which would be conditioned and be subject to enforcement.
- With regard to the studio, it was noted that the Inspector had removed permitted development rights. Therefore, if the existing permission was implemented, this could not be erected at a later time under part 1 of permitted development rights.
- The local Member for Llanybi Fawr, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed concern regarding the soil that had been spread between the new property and the existing stream. When the topsoil is put back he asked for assurances that the ground level would be returned to the level before work commenced on the site. Planning Officers confirmed that the site would return to the original ground level when work is completed.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2019/01377 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition to secure an obscurely glazed window to the north elevation. Also, ensure that a list of approved drawings includes an approved topographical survey of the previous approval, as well as a cross section in the current application.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	12
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01377 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition to secure an obscurely glazed window to the north elevation. Also, ensure that a list of approved drawings includes an approved topographical survey of the previous approval, as well as a cross section in the current application.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
December, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

6. Application DM/2019/01672 - Proposed sub-division of existing dwelling into two residential units. The Courtyard, Carrow Road, Carrow Hill, Caerwent

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor A. Davies and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2019/01672 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01672 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal Agreement.

7. Application DM/2019/01740 - Change of use from C1 Guest House to C2 residential care facility and two storey rear extension. Black Lion Guest House, 43 Hereford Road, Abergavenny, NP7 5PY

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the three conditions as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application and the support expressed by the Committee, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor S. Woodhouse that application DM/2019/01740 be approved subject to the three conditions as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	14
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01740 be approved subject to the three conditions as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
December, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

- 8. Application DM/2019/01804 - Change of use of ground floor from a gymnasium and exercise centre to a facility for rough sleepers provided by a project run in partnership with Monmouthshire County Council and Gwent Police. The facility will be operational in the winter months, initially from January to the beginning of March, but may run to the end of March according to need and the availability of suitably checked and trained volunteers. Nelson Museum and Local History Centre, Old Market Hall, Priory Street, Monmouth**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application and the support expressed by the Committee it was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor A. Davies that application DM/2019/01804 be approved subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	14
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01804 be approved subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report.

9. New Appeals - 23rd October to 20th November 2019.

We noted the new appeals received between 23rd October and 20th November 2019.

The meeting ended at 3.34 pm.